

Design Review Board

October 14, 2019

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE HELD ON WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 14, 2019, AT 6:30 P.M. IN THE MEN'S LOUNGE OF THE CLARK MEMORIAL CLUBHOUSE, 19 N. NINTH STREET, CLARKDALE, AZ.

BOARD MEMBERS:

Interim Chairperson	Robyn Prud'homme-Bauer	Present
Board Members	Michael Pierce	Present
	Michael Lindner	Excused
	Linsey Branam	Present
	Matthew Kaempfe	Excused

STAFF:

Project Manager	Mike Gray
Interim Planning Manager	Ruth Mayday

A **Special Meeting** of the Design Review Board of the Town of Clarkdale was held on Monday, October 14, 2019, at 6:30 p.m. in the Men's Lounge of the Clark Memorial Clubhouse, 19 N. Ninth Street, Clarkdale, AZ.

1. **AGENDA ITEM: CALL TO ORDER:** Interim Chair Prud'homme-Bauer called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.
2. **AGENDA ITEM: ROLL CALL:** Project Manager Gray called roll.
3. **AGENDA ITEM: PUBLIC COMMENT:**
 - a. The public is invited to provide comments at this time on items that are not on this agenda. Action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision on a later agenda, as required by the Arizona Open Meeting Law. Each speaker is asked to limit comments to **FIVE minutes**.

No public comment.

4. AGENDA ITEM: MINUTES:

- a. Consideration of the **Regular Meeting Minutes of May 1, 2019.**
Board Member Pierce made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of February 6, 2019. Board Member Branam seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Design Review Board

October 14, 2019

Chair Prud'homme-Bauer	Aye
Board Member Pierce	Aye
Board Member Branam	Aye
Board Member Lindner	Excused
Board Member Kaempfe	Excused

5. AGENDA ITEM: REPORTS: Chairperson and Member Report:

No reports.

6. AGENDA ITEM: NEW BUSINESS:

a. Introduction of new Design Review Board members and election of officers.

Staff recommended tabling the election of Board Members until the next meeting or until such time as a quorum is present. Board Member Michael Pierce moved to table the item until such time as a quorum is present and the motion was seconded by Board Member Branam.

Chair Prud'homme-Bauer	Aye
Board Member Pierce	Aye
Board Member Branam	Aye
Board Member Lindner	Excused
Board Member Kaempfe	Excused

b. DISCUSSION/POSSIBLE ACTION: Design review of application 092477, signage proposed for Purely Splendid Spa, 915 Main Street, APN 400-03-160.

CDD Project Manager Gray presented the application with a Power Point presentation.

Summary: The proposed signage is for a portable sandwich board type sign and optional window signage. The applicant did not supply all necessary information to determine safety of the sign in event of wind gusts etc. Discussion followed the presentation.

DISCUSSION:

The applicant produced her proposed stuffed animal weight but lacked details to attach it to the sign in stable manner. A lengthy discussion ensued regarding the achievement of this objective. Staff requested the Board extend approval for staff to work with the applicant and to approve the method of sign weighting administratively.

Board Action: Board Member Pierce moved to approve the application with stipulations proposed by staff and to grant staff the ability to approve the method of sign weighting

Design Review Board
October 14, 2019

administratively. The motion was seconded by Board Member Branam. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Prud'homme-Bauer	Aye
Board Member Pierce	Aye
Board Member Branam	Aye
Board Member Lindner	Excused
Board Member Kaempfe	Excused

c. DISCUSSION/POSSIBLE ACTION: Site Plan and Design Review of application 092393, the approved APS Clarkdale Substation, APN 406-27-053B, located at 1591 State Route 89A.

CDD Project Manager Gray:

Presented the application with a Power Point presentation. The presentation was interrupted by a member of the public with a question. At the conclusion, staff invited the applicant's agent up to present renderings of the site and to answer questions of the Board.

Board discussion following the presentation:

Chair Prud'homme-Bauer:

- Requested applicant work with staff to implement sustainable development practices per the Town's Sustainable Development Guidelines such as permeable surfaces and passive water harvesting
- Emphasized staff comments that emergency lighting should be equipped with an automatic shutoff
- Expressed dismay at stipulation for evergreen trees around enclosure – stated they are not as commonly seen in the area as other species like mesquite and desert willow
- Requested information around the stipulated 15' buffer along State Route 89A as opposed to a 25' buffer
- Wall design is boring. Clarkdale is an artistic community and the applicant should consider an RFP (Request for Proposal) process to integrate input from local artists
- Suggested improvement or relocation of the social path
- Expressed appreciation of joint access with VVFD
- Requested staff information about feasibility of incorporating passive water harvesting and other sustainable elements

Applicant's Engineer Ryan Weed:

- Discussed aesthetics of the enclosure and landscaping, and how the features inter-face
- Observed a dichotomy between the public's concern to conceal the wall vs efforts to make it more architecturally appealing

Design Review Board

October 14, 2019

- Pointed out public input demanded concealment of the wall
 - Recommended avoidance of translucent backing materials for the gates due to safety (glass) and durability (plastic) but suggests a tighter mesh
 - Expressed concern for vehicle weight and compatibility with permeable surfaces
 - Discussed aesthetics of the enclosure and landscaping, and how the features inter-face
 - Expressed concern for the construction timeline when extending various processes
- collaboration with artist community
- Expressed concern around artistic elements with APS criteria – possibility that artistic elements could make the enclosure more climbable. Possibility that APS could have other concerns, so they would need to be involved in discussion

Board Member Michael Pierce:

- Requested clarification as to visibility of the gates from various aspects along SR89A

Board Member Linsey Branam:

- Requested information on any code requirements around the height of new trees

Staff advised T.O.C Zoning Code Chapter 9 Landscape Design Standards does address this, but the specifics will be researched and brought back to the Board

- Can DRB stipulate the applicant plant larger trees than required by code
- Observed the subjectivity around what people consider “art” and the associated difficulty reaching consensus

Interim Planning Manager Ruth Mayday:

- Responded to discussion around evergreen stipulation. Warned against possibility of undermining the intent of Council
- Cited several reasons any discussion of incorporating artwork into the enclosure should be in the form of an informal discussion

Public Works-Utilities Director Maher Hazine:

- Offered assurance that site drainage had been examined and issues addressed
- Supported the position that public comment pointed toward concealment of the enclosure wall, as opposed to drawing attention to it
- Supported Mr. Weed’s position that expansion of the buffer along 89A would entail further encroachment of the wash, or diminishing the size of the substation

Project Manager Mike Gray:

- Agreed to research T.O.C. Chapter 9 - Landscape Standards and get back to the Board with Minimum tree height requirements

Design Review Board
October 14, 2019

- Responding to a question about the Town's adopted Sustainability Guidelines, makes a distinction between code requirements and guidelines
- Responded to question about permeable surfaces and departmental willingness to work with the applicant to incorporate sustainable elements

Board Member Michael Lindner (Excused)

Board Member Matthew Kaempfe (Excused)

Public Comment:

Clarkdale Resident Jane Henson:

- Asked questions regarding wall height
- Requested information on site drainage and proceeded to advise the Town to do "something a little more designed instead of just digging a ditch"

After seven minutes, the time overage was announced. Ms. Henson was allowed to continue.

- Ms. Henson makes further suggestions to incorporate art
- States her agreement that evergreens don't belong here

In response to resident Jane Henson's erosion concerns, the applicant's Engineer Ryan Weed and Town Engineer Maher Hazine indicated these items had already been examined and addressed. They explained details of the drainage plan and the Town Code requirement that if untoward erosion occurs, the applicant will be required to return and remediate the situation.

Public Comments closed.

After discussion, Ms. Henson asks to return for comment. Board Member Branam requests this be granted.

- Ms. Henson made recommendations on shifting budgeted costs for the decorative gates to other artistic elements

Board Member Michael Pierce:

- Pointed out that budgetary considerations of private projects are not the responsibility of the DRB

Board Action: Board Member Michael Pierce moved to approve the application with the stipulations that:

1. **Automatic shutoff shall be incorporated into emergency lighting**
2. **Informal agreement with art community and DRB Chair to develop additional features to enhance the site**
3. **The applicant will work with staff to incorporate sustainable elements**

The motion was seconded by Board Member Linsey Branam. The motion passed unanimously.

Design Review Board
October 14, 2019

Chair Prud'homme-Bauer	Aye
Board Member Pierce	Aye
Board Member Branam	Aye
Board Member Lindner	Excused
Board Member Kaempfe	Excused

7. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:

a. DISCUSSION/POSSIBLE ACTION: Site Plan and Design Review of application 092471, facility expansion of the Bodega Pierce Tasting Room and Winery, APN 406-26-010H, located at 1341 State Route 89A.

ADJOURNMENT:

Board Member Pierce made a motion to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Board Member Branam and the meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:11 PM.

Chair Prud'homme-Bauer	Aye
Board Member Pierce	Aye
Board Member Branam	Aye
Board Member Lindner	Excused
Board Member Kaempfe	Excused

APPROVED BY:



Chairperson

Robyn Prud'homme-Bauer

SUBMITTED BY:



Project Manager

Mike Gray